

Audit



Report

OFFICE OF THE INSPECTOR GENERAL

**DEFENSE BASE REALIGNMENT AND CLOSURE
BUDGET DATA FOR THE CONSTRUCTION OF
AN ADDITION TO THE CHAPEL CENTER AT
SHEPPARD AIR FORCE BASE, TEXAS**

Report No. 97-013

October 30, 1996

Department of Defense

Additional Copies

To obtain additional copies of this audit report, contact the Secondary Reports Distribution Unit of the Analysis, Planning, and Technical Support Directorate at (703) 604-8937 (DSN 664-8937) or FAX (703) 604-8932.

Suggestions for Future Audits

To suggest ideas for or to request future audits, contact the Planning and Coordination Branch of the Analysis, Planning, and Technical Support Directorate at (703) 604-8939 (DSN 664-8939) or FAX (703) 604-8932. Ideas and requests can also be mailed to:

OAIG-AUD (ATTN: APTS Audit Suggestions)
Inspector General, Department of Defense
400 Army Navy Drive (Room 801)
Arlington, Virginia 22202-2884

Defense Hotline

To report fraud, waste, or abuse, contact the Defense Hotline by calling (800) 424-9098; by sending an electronic message to Hotline@DODIG.OSD.MIL; or by writing the Defense Hotline, The Pentagon, Washington, D.C. 20301-1900. The identity of each writer and caller is fully protected.

Acronyms

BRAC
MILCON

Base Realignment and Closure
Military Construction



INSPECTOR GENERAL
DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE
400 ARMY NAVY DRIVE
ARLINGTON, VIRGINIA 22202-2884



Report No. 97-013

October 30, 1996

**MEMORANDUM FOR ASSISTANT SECRETARY OF THE AIR FORCE
(FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT AND COMPTROLLER)**

SUBJECT: Audit of Defense Base Realignment and Closure Budget Data for the Construction of an Addition to the Chapel Center at Sheppard Air Force Base, Texas (Project No. 6CG-5001.52)

Introduction

We are providing this audit report for your information and use. The audit was required by Public Law 102-190, "National Defense Authorization Act for Fiscal Years 1992 and 1993," December 5, 1991. Enclosure 1 provides details on the history of the Defense base realignment and closure (BRAC) process and on our auditing and reporting requirements.

This report is one in a series about FY 1997 BRAC military construction (MILCON) costs. This report discusses project VNVP933025, "Add to Chapel Center," valued at \$770,000, resulting from the closure of Lowry Air Force Base, Colorado, and realignment to Sheppard Air Force Base, Texas.

Audit Results

The Air Force properly supported the cost estimates for project VNVP933025, "Add to Chapel Center." The Air Force based project costs contained in the DD Form 1391, "FY 1997 Military Construction Project Data," on an architectural and engineering contractor's cost estimate. The Air Force properly supported the project cost estimates with adequate data.

Audit Objectives

The overall audit objective was to determine the accuracy of BRAC MILCON budget data. The specific objectives were to determine whether the proposed project was a valid BRAC requirement, whether the decision for MILCON was supported with required documentation including an economic analysis, and whether the economic analysis considered existing facilities. Inspector General, DoD, Report No. 96-166, "Defense Base Realignment and Closure Budget Data for the Closure of Lowry Air Force Base, Colorado, and Realignment to Sheppard Air Force Base, Texas," June 18, 1996, discussed three projects related to the realignment. The report stated that the Air Force overestimated requirements and costs for project VNVP933025, "Add to Chapel Center." This audit is a follow-up review to determine whether project VNVP933025, "Add to Chapel Center," used valid BRAC requirements; specifically, valid cost

estimates for the chapel center addition. The audit also assessed the adequacy of the management control program as it applied to the overall audit objective. The management control program objective will be discussed in a summary report on FY 1997 BRAC MILCON budget data.

Scope and Methodology

Scope of This Audit. We examined the FY 1997 BRAC MILCON budget request and supporting documentation for project VNVP933025, "Add to Chapel Center." We did not use computer-processed data or statistical sampling procedures to conduct this audit. See Enclosure 1 for additional information on the overall scope of the audit of BRAC MILCON costs.

Audit Period, Standards, and Locations. This economy and efficiency audit was conducted from August through September 1996, in accordance with auditing standards issued by the Comptroller General of the United States as implemented by the Inspector General, DoD. Enclosure 3 lists the organizations visited or contacted during the audit.

Prior Audits and Other Reviews

Since 1991, numerous reports have addressed DoD BRAC issues. Enclosure 2 lists the summary reports for the audits of BRAC budget data for FYs 1992 through 1996 and BRAC audit reports published since the summary reports.

Audit Background

The FY 1993 BRAC Commission recommended closure of Lowry Air Force Base and realignment to Sheppard Air Force Base. The realignment resulted in BRAC MILCON project VNVP933025, "Add to Chapel Center." Inspector General, DoD, Report No. 96-166 stated that the Air Force overestimated space requirements for the project. The report recommended that the Air Force submit a revised DD Form 1391, "FY 1997 Military Construction Project Data," that reflected valid BRAC requirements and costs.

Discussion

Original DD Form 1391. The original DD Form 1391 for the chapel center addition contained overestimated space requirements and unsupported cost estimates. A portion of the overestimated space requirements consisted of a preexisting space deficiency, and the other portion was not explained. The Air Force did not have supporting documentation for the cost estimates. As requested by Inspector General, DoD, Report No. 96-166, the Air Force resubmitted a DD Form 1391 for the chapel center addition with a valid BRAC

requirement of 4,200 square feet. We reviewed the cost estimate associated with the resubmission of the DD Form 1391.

Resubmitted DD Form 1391. The Air Force properly supported the cost data for the chapel center addition on the resubmitted DD Form 1391 by logically and accurately determining and documenting the cost estimates. The Air Force supported the amount identified on the DD Form 1391, \$770,000, with an architectural and engineering contractor's cost estimate. The cost estimate was based on the architectural and engineering contractor's total design of the chapel center addition.

Management Comments

We provided a draft of this report to you on September 23, 1996. Because the report contains no findings or recommendations, no comments were required, and none were received. Therefore, we are publishing this memorandum report in final form.

We appreciate the courtesies extended to the audit staff. For additional information on this report, please contact Mr. Joseph P. Doyle, Audit Program Director, at (703) 604-9348 (DSN 664-9348) or Mr. John Yonaitis, Audit Project Manager, at (703) 604-9231 (DSN 664-9231). The audit team members are listed inside the back cover.



David K. Steensma
Deputy Assistant Inspector General
for Auditing

Enclosures

Background of Defense Base Realignment and Closure and Scope of the Audit of FY 1997 Defense Base Realignment and Closure Military Construction Costs

Commission on Defense Base Closure and Realignment. On May 3, 1988, the Secretary of Defense chartered the Commission on Defense Base Closure and Realignment (the Commission) to recommend military installations for realignment and closure. Congress passed Public Law 100-526, "Defense Authorization Amendments and Base Closure and Realignment Act," October 24, 1988, which enacted the Commission's recommendations. The law also established the Defense Base Closure Account to fund any necessary facility renovation or MILCON projects associated with BRAC. Public Law 101-510, "Defense Base Closure and Realignment Act of 1990," November 5, 1990, reestablished the Commission. The law also chartered the Commission to meet during calendar years 1991, 1993, and 1995 to verify that the process for realigning and closing military installations was timely and independent. In addition, the law stipulates that realignment and closure actions must be completed within 6 years after the President transmits the recommendations to Congress.

Required Defense Reviews of BRAC Estimates. Public Law 102-190, "National Defense Authorization Act for Fiscal Years 1992 and 1993," December 5, 1991, states that the Secretary of Defense shall ensure that the authorization amount that DoD requested for each MILCON project associated with BRAC actions does not exceed the original estimated cost provided to the Commission. Public Law 102-190 also states that the Inspector General, DoD, must evaluate significant increases in BRAC MILCON project costs over the estimated costs provided to the Commission and send a report to the congressional Defense committees.

Military Department BRAC Cost-Estimating Process. To develop cost estimates for the Commission, the Military Departments used the Cost of Base Realignment Actions computer model. The Cost of Base Realignment Actions computer model uses standard cost factors to convert the suggested BRAC options into dollar values to provide a way to compare the different options. After the President and Congress approve the BRAC actions, DoD realigning activity officials prepare a DD Form 1391, "FY 1997 Military Construction Project Data," for each individual MILCON project required to accomplish the realigning actions. The Cost of Base Realignment Actions computer model provides cost estimates as a realignment and closure package for a particular realigning or closing base. The DD Form 1391 provides specific cost estimates for an individual BRAC MILCON project.

Limitations and Expansion to Overall Audit Scope. Because the Cost of Base Realignment Actions computer model develops cost estimates as a BRAC package and not for individual BRAC MILCON projects, we were unable to determine the amount of cost increases for each individual BRAC MILCON

Background of Defense Base Realignment and Closure and Scope of the Audit of FY 1997 Defense Base Realignment and Closure Military Construction Costs

project. Additionally, because of prior audit efforts that determined potential problems with all BRAC MILCON projects, our audit objectives included all large BRAC MILCON projects.

Overall Audit Selection Process. We reviewed the FY 1997 BRAC MILCON \$820.8 million budget submitted by the Military Departments and the Defense Logistics Agency. We excluded projects that were previously reviewed by DoD audit organizations. We grouped the remaining BRAC MILCON projects by location and selected groups of projects that totaled at least \$1 million for each group. We also reviewed those FY 1996 BRAC MILCON projects that were not included in the previous FY 1996 budget submission, but were added as part of the FY 1997 BRAC MILCON budget package.

Summary of Prior Audits and Other Reviews

Since 1991, numerous audit reports have addressed DoD BRAC issues. This enclosure lists the summary reports for the audits of BRAC budget data for FYs 1992 through 1996 and BRAC audit reports published since the summary reports.

Inspector General, DoD

<u>Report No.</u>	<u>Report Title</u>	<u>Date</u>
96-218	Quick Reaction Report on Defense Base Realignment and Closure Budget Data for the Closure of Naval Air Station Barbers Point, Hawaii, and Realignment to Marine Corps Base Hawaii Kaneohe Bay	September 4, 1996
96-209	Defense Base Realignment and Closure Budget Data for the Closure of Defense Electronics Supply Center Dayton, Ohio, and Realignment to Defense Supply Center Columbus, Ohio	August 13, 1996
96-206	Defense Base Realignment and Closure Budget Data for the Realignment of Navy and Air Force Food Services Training at Lackland Air Force Base, Texas	August 2, 1996
96-204	Defense Base Realignment and Closure Budget Data for the Realignment of the Deployment Function for the 10th Mountain Infantry (Light) Division to Fort Drum, New York	July 31, 1996
96-199	Defense Base Realignment and Closure Budget Data for the Realignment of the Defense Distribution Depot Columbus, Ohio	July 25, 1996
96-191	Defense Base Realignment and Closure Budget Data for the Relocation of the Carrier Air Wings From Naval Air Station Miramar, California, to Naval Air Station Lemoore, California	July 3, 1996

Summary of Prior Audits and Other Reviews

Inspector General, DoD (cont'd)

<u>Report No.</u>	<u>Report Title</u>	<u>Date</u>
96-171	Defense Base Realignment and Closure Budget Data for Realigning the Office of the Judge Advocate General and the Naval Facilities Engineering Command to the Washington Navy Yard	June 21, 1996
96-170	Defense Base Realignment and Closure Budget Data for the Realignment of Five Navy Activities From Leased Space in Arlington, Virginia, to the Naval Security Station, Washington, D.C.	June 19, 1996
96-166	Defense Base Realignment and Closure Budget Data for the Closure of Lowry Air Force Base, Colorado, and Realignment to Sheppard Air Force Base, Texas	June 18, 1996
96-165	Defense Base Realignment and Closure Budget Data for the Construction of the Hazardous Material Storage Addition to Warehouse 28 at Defense Distribution Region West Tracy, California	June 17, 1996
96-158	Defense Base Realignment and Closure Budget Data for the Redirect of the 726th Air Control Squadron From Shaw Air Force Base, South Carolina, to Mountain Home Air Force Base, Idaho	June 11, 1996
96-154	Defense Base Realignment and Closure Budget Data for the Realignment of the National Airborne Operations Center to Wright-Patterson Air Force Base, Ohio	June 10, 1996
96-147	Defense Base Realignment and Closure Budget Data for the Closure of Naval Training Center Orlando, Florida, and Realignment of Maintenance and Storage Facilities to Taft U.S. Army Reserve Center, Orlando, Florida	June 6, 1996
96-144	Defense Base Realignment and Closure Budget Data for the Realignment of Grissom Air Reserve Base, Indiana	June 6, 1996

Summary of Prior Audits and Other Reviews

Inspector General, DoD (cont'd)

<u>Report No.</u>	<u>Report Title</u>	<u>Date</u>
96-142	Defense Base Realignment and Closure Budget Data for the Closure of Bergstrom Air Reserve Base, Texas, and Realignment of the 10th Air Force Headquarters to Naval Air Station Fort Worth, Joint Reserve Base, Texas	June 5, 1996
96-139	Defense Base Realignment and Closure Budget Data for the Closure of Griffiss Air Force Base and Realignment of Rome Laboratory and Northeast Air Defense Sector, Rome, New York	June 3, 1996
96-137	Defense Base Realignment and Closure Budget Data for the Realignment of March Air Force Base, Riverside, California	May 31, 1996
96-136	Defense Base Realignment and Closure Budget Data for the Closure of Gentile Air Force Station, Dayton, Ohio, and Realignment of Defense Logistics Agency Components to Wright-Patterson Air Force Base, Ohio	May 31, 1996
96-135	Defense Base Realignment and Closure Budget Data for the Fleet Anti-Submarine Warfare Training Center Pacific, San Diego, California	May 30, 1996
96-131	Defense Base Realignment and Closure Budget Data for Realigning Elements of Headquarters, Department of the Navy, to the Washington Navy Yard	May 28, 1996
96-128	Defense Base Realignment and Closure Budget Data for the Naval Training Center Great Lakes, Illinois	May 24, 1996
96-127	Defense Base Realignment and Closure Budget Data for the Closure of Roslyn Air National Guard Base and Realignments to Stewart Air National Guard Base, New York	May 23, 1996

Summary of Prior Audits and Other Reviews

Inspector General, DoD (cont'd)

<u>Report No.</u>	<u>Report Title</u>	<u>Date</u>
96-126	Defense Base Realignment and Closure Budget Data for the Realignment of Rickenbacker Air National Guard Base, Ohio	May 21, 1996
96-122	Defense Base Realignment and Closure Budget Data for the Realignment of the Air Education and Training Command at Vandenberg Air Force Base, California	May 17, 1996
96-119	Defense Base Realignment and Closure Budget Data for the Construction of a Multiple Purpose Facility at Fort McCoy, Wisconsin	May 14, 1996
96-118	Defense Base Realignment and Closure Budget Data for the Medical and Dental Clinic Expansion Project at Naval Weapons Station Charleston, South Carolina	May 13, 1996
96-116	Defense Base Realignment and Closure Budget Data for the Relocation of Deployable Medical Systems to Hill Air Force Base, Ogden, Utah	May 10, 1996
96-112	Defense Base Realignment and Closure Budget Data for the Closure of Naval Air Station Cecil Field, Florida, and Realignment of the Aviation Physiology Training Unit to Naval Air Station Jacksonville, Florida	May 7, 1996
96-110	Defense Base Realignment and Closure Budget Data for the Realignment of the 301st Rescue Squadron, Air Force Reserve, From Homestead Air Force Base, Florida, to Patrick Air Force Base, Florida	May 7, 1996
96-108	Defense Base Realignment and Closure Budget Data for the Naval Shipyard, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania	May 6, 1996

Summary of Prior Audits and Other Reviews

Inspector General, DoD (cont'd)

<u>Report No.</u>	<u>Report Title</u>	<u>Date</u>
96-104	Defense Base Realignment and Closure Budget Data for the Construction of the Overwater Antenna Test Range Facility at Newport, Rhode Island	April 26, 1996
96-101	Defense Base Realignment and Closure Budget Data for the Closure of Naval Air Station Barbers Point, Hawaii, and Realignment of P-3 Aircraft Squadrons to Naval Air Station Whidbey Island, Washington	April 26, 1996
96-093	Summary Report on the Audit of Defense Base Realignment and Closure Budget Data for FYs 1995 and 1996	April 3, 1996
94-040	Summary Report on the Audit of Defense Base Closure and Realignment Budget Data for FYs 1993 and 1994	February 14, 1994
93-100	Summary Report on the Audit of Defense Base Closure and Realignment Budget Data for Fiscal Years 1992 and 1993	May 25, 1993

Organizations Visited or Contacted

Office of the Secretary of Defense

Under Secretary of Defense (Comptroller), Washington, DC

Department of the Air Force

Deputy Assistant Secretary of the Air Force (Installations), Base Transition Division,
Washington, DC

Air Education and Training Command, Randolph Air Force Base, TX
82d Training Wing, Sheppard Air Force Base, TX

Report Distribution

Office of the Secretary of Defense

Under Secretary of Defense (Comptroller)
Deputy Chief Financial Officer
Deputy Comptroller (Program/Budget)
Deputy Under Secretary of Defense (Industrial Affairs and Installations)
Principal Assistant Deputy Under Secretary of Defense (Industrial Affairs
and Installations)
Assistant to the Secretary of Defense (Public Affairs)
Director, Defense Logistics Studies Information Exchange

Department of the Army

Auditor General, Department of the Army

Department of the Navy

Assistant Secretary of the Navy (Financial Management and Comptroller)
Auditor General, Department of the Navy

Department of the Air Force

Assistant Secretary of the Air Force (Financial Management and Comptroller)
Base Transition Division, Deputy Assistant Secretary of the Air Force (Installations)
Auditor General, Department of the Air Force
Commander, Air Education and Training Command
Commander, 82d Training Wing

Other Defense Organizations

Director, Defense Contract Audit Agency
Director, Defense Logistics Agency
Director, National Security Agency
Inspector General, National Security Agency
Inspector General, Defense Intelligence Agency

Report Distribution

Non-Defense Federal Organizations and Individuals

Office of Management and Budget
Technical Information Center, National Security and International Affairs Division,
General Accounting Office

Chairman and ranking minority member of each of the following congressional committees and subcommittees:

Senate Committee on Appropriations
Senate Subcommittee on Defense, Committee on Appropriations
Senate Subcommittee on Military Construction, Committee on Appropriations
Senate Committee on Armed Services
Senate Committee on Governmental Affairs
House Committee on Appropriations
House Subcommittee on Military Construction, Committee on Appropriations
House Subcommittee on National Security, Committee on Appropriations
House Committee on Government Reform and Oversight
House Subcommittee on National Security, International Affairs, and Criminal
Justice, Committee on Government Reform and Oversight
House Committee on National Security

Audit Team Members

This report was prepared by the Contract Management Directorate, Office of the Assistant Inspector General for Auditing, DoD.

Paul J. Granetto
Joseph P. Doyle
John Yonaitis
Ellen P. Neff
Michelle D. Yantachka
Robin A. Hysmith